

Colorado Supreme Court  
2 East 14<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Denver, CO 80203

Appeal from the District Court, Water Division 1  
Honorable Todd L. Taylor  
Case No. 19CW3236

**Applicant-Appellant:**  
TOWN OF FIRESTONE,

v.

**Opposers-Appellees:**  
BCL COLORADO LP, CITY AND COUNT OF  
BROOMFIELD, CITY OF BOULDER, CITY OF  
ENGLEWOOD, CITY OF LAFAYETTE, CITY OF  
LONGMONT, CITY OF WESTMINSTER, DREAM  
WEAVER HOLDINGS, LLC, GODDING DITCH  
COMPANY, LAST CHANCE DITCH COMPANY, LG  
EVERIST, INC., LITTLE THOMPSON WATER DISTRICT,  
NEW COAL RIDGE DITCH COMPANY, NEW  
CONSOLIDATED LOWER BOULDER RESERVOIR AND  
DITCH COMPANY, PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY OF  
COLORADO, RURAL DITCH COMPANY, SHORES ON  
PLUM CREEK METROPOLITAN DISTRICT NO. 1, ST.  
VRAIN LEFT HAND WATER CONSERVATION DISTRICT,  
ST. VRAIN SANITATION DISTRICT, STATE ENGINEER  
AND WATER DIVISION 1 ENGINEER, TOWN OF  
FREDERICK, VARRA COMPANIES, INC., WATER USERS  
ASSOCIATION OF DISTRICT NO. 6.

COURT USE ONLY

Bradley C. Grasmick, #35055  
Wesley S. Knoll, #48747  
Richard LiPuma #17892  
Jacklyn P. Gunn, #59386  
Lawrence Custer Grasmick Jones & Donovan, LLP  
5245 Ronald Reagan Blvd., Suite 1  
Johnstown, CO 80534  
Telephone: (970)622-8181  
Fax No. (970) 660-4412  
Email: [brad@lcwaterlaw.com](mailto:brad@lcwaterlaw.com); [wes@lcwaterlaw.com](mailto:wes@lcwaterlaw.com);  
[rich@lcwaterlaw.com](mailto:rich@lcwaterlaw.com); [jacklyn@lcwaterlaw.com](mailto:jacklyn@lcwaterlaw.com)

Case No.

**APPLICANT-APPELLANT TOWN OF FIRESTONE'S  
NOTICE OF APPEAL**

Plaintiff-Appellant, Town of Firestone (“Firestone”), by and through its attorneys, Lawrence Custer Grasmick Jones & Donovan, LLP, hereby submits this Notice of Appeal pursuant to Rules 3(a), 3(d) and 4(a), C.A.R.

**I. Nature of the Case.**

**A. Nature of the controversy.**

Firestone filed a water rights application seeking conditional water rights for groundwater and a plan for augmentation in connection with the development of its municipal water system. Appellee St. Vrain Sanitation District (the “District”) was the only opposing party that participated at trial.

Prior to trial, the parties stipulated that: “The proposed URF depletion patterns for the FAST Well Field, Firestone Trail Well Field, and FAST North Well Field are adequate to prevent injury.” At trial, however, the District claimed for the first time that Firestone’s proposed URF depletion patterns for these wells were inadequate because the location of not-yet-constructed wells were not described with exact precision. The District contested Firestone’s proposed URF depletion pattern for the St. Vrain Sanitation District Well Field for the same reason. The water court then granted the District’s Rule 41(b) motion dismissing the conditional water right

claims for the St. Vrain Sanitation District Well Field, FAST North Well Field and Firestone Trail Well Field for failure to describe well locations with exact precision.

The Water Court subsequently entered its *Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Decree of the Water Court* on February 21, 2024, decreeing Firestone's uncontested claims and certain conditional groundwater right claims that were not dismissed pursuant to Rule 41(b). The Decree also approved Firestone's plan for augmentation for decreed structures.

**B. The judgment and decree being appealed, including the basis for this Court's jurisdiction.**

Firestone is appealing: (1) the Order Granting in Part, and Denying in Part, St. Vrain Sanitation District's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to C.R.C.P. Rule 41(b)(1), entered on December 4, 2023; and (2) the Findings of Fact, Conclusion of Law, and Decree of the Water Court, entered on February 21, 2024. This Court has appellate jurisdiction pursuant to Rules 1(a)(2), 1(e), and 4(a), C.A.R., C.R.S. § 13-4-102(1)(d), and Colo. Const. Art. VI, § 2(2).

**C. Whether the judgment and decree resolved all issues pending before the water court.**

The February 21, 2024 Decree of the Water Court resolved all pending matters before the Water Court.

**D. Whether the judgment and decree were made final for purposes of appeal pursuant to C.R.C.P. 54(b).**

Not Applicable.

**E. The date the order was entered.**

The Rule 41 Order was entered on December 4, 2023; The Findings of Fact, Conclusion of Law, and Decree of the Water Court was entered on February 21, 2024.

**F. Extensions to file motions for post-trial relief.**

No extensions for post-trial relief were sought or granted.

**G. Motions for post-trial relief.**

Not Applicable.

**H. Denials of motions for post-trial relief.**

Not Applicable.

**I. Extensions to file notice of appeal.**

None.

**J. Description of Water Rights.**

Pursuant to Rule 1(e), C.A.R., the water rights involved in this appeal are conditional groundwater rights in the St. Vrain alluvium, as described in the proposed decree tendered to the Water Court for the St. Vrain Sanitation District

Well Field, the FAST North Well Field and the Firestone Trail Well Field, including those parts of the augmentation plan to replace depletions associated with groundwater diversions to be made from these structures.

## **II. Advisory Listing of Issues to be Raised on Appeal.**

A. Whether the Water Court erroneously required Firestone to support its claim for conditional groundwater rights with the exact location of diversions and precise determination of the timing, location and amount of depletions.

B. Whether the Water Court erroneously allowed the District to raise issues at trial for the first time after stipulating pursuant to U.L.R. 11(b)(6)(B) that such issues were undisputed.

C. Whether the Water Court applied the wrong standard for determining motions under C.R.C.P. 41(b)(1).

D. Whether the Water Court erroneously incorporated hypotheticals posed by opposing counsel into its factual findings.

E. Whether the Water Court erroneously dismissed Firestone's claims rather than allowing additional terms and conditions sufficient to remedy any potential injury to senior water rights.

F. Whether the Water Court misinterpreted its retained jurisdiction authority for conditional water rights and plans for augmentation for conditional water rights.

G. Whether the Water Court's findings of fact relating to URF calculations and the location of the claimed wellfields were clearly erroneous.

**III. Whether the Transcript of any Evidence Taken Before the Trial Court or Any Administrative Agency is Necessary to Resolve the Issues Raised on Appeal.**

Transcripts of the trial and all related proceedings before the water court shall be necessary to resolve the issues raised in this appeal.

**IV. Whether the Order on Review Was Issued by a Magistrate Where Consent Was Necessary.**

Not Applicable.

## **V. Names of Counsel for the Parties.**

### Attorneys for Town of Firestone

Bradley C. Grasmick, #35055

Wesley S. Knoll, #48747

Richard LiPuma #17892

Jacklyn P. Gunn, #59386

Lawrence Custer Grasmick Jones & Donovan, LLP

5245 Ronald Reagan Blvd., Suite 1

Johnstown, CO 80534

Telephone: (970)622-8181

[brad@lcwaterlaw.com](mailto:brad@lcwaterlaw.com)

[wes@lcwaterlaw.com](mailto:wes@lcwaterlaw.com)

[rich@lcwaterlaw.com](mailto:rich@lcwaterlaw.com)

[jacklyn@lcwaterlaw.com](mailto:jacklyn@lcwaterlaw.com)

### Attorneys for St. Vrain Sanitation District

Matthew Machado, #31233

Casey J. Weaver, #56605

Lyons Gaddis, PC

950 Spruce Street, Suite 1B

Louisville, CO 80027

Telephone: (720) 726-3672

[mmachado@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:mmachado@lyonsgaddis.com)

[cweaver@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:cweaver@lyonsgaddis.com)

### Attorneys for BCL Colorado LP

Stephen C. Larson, #23275

Michael S. Davidson, #42319

JOHNSON & REPUCCI LLP

850 W. South Boulder Rd, Suite 100

Louisville, Colorado 80027

Telephone: (303) 442-1900

Facsimile: (303) 442-0191

[sclarson@j-rlaw.com](mailto:sclarson@j-rlaw.com)

[msdavidson@j-rlaw.com](mailto:msdavidson@j-rlaw.com)

Attorneys for opposer City and County of Broomfield

Cynthia F. Covell, #10169  
Andrea L. Benson, #33176  
Gilbert Y. Marchand, Jr., #19870  
Alperstein & Covell, P.C.  
1391 Speer, Suite 730  
Denver, CO 80204  
Telephone: (303) 894-8191  
[cfc@alpersteincovell.com](mailto:cfc@alpersteincovell.com)  
[alb@alpersteincovell.com](mailto:alb@alpersteincovell.com)  
[gym@alpersteincovell.com](mailto:gym@alpersteincovell.com)

Attorneys for the City of Boulder

Lisa M. Thompson, #35923  
Michael A. Kopp, #43204  
TROUT RALEY  
1120 Lincoln Street, Suite 1600  
Denver, Colorado 80203  
Telephone: (303) 861-1963  
[lthompson@troutlaw.com](mailto:lthompson@troutlaw.com)  
[mkopp@troutlaw.com](mailto:mkopp@troutlaw.com)

Jessica L. Pault-Atiase, #36739  
THE CITY OF BOULDER, COLORADO  
OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY  
1777 Broadway  
P. O. Box 791  
Boulder, Colorado 80306-0791  
Telephone: (303) 441-3020  
[pault-atiasej@bouldercolorado.gov](mailto:pault-atiasej@bouldercolorado.gov)

Special Counsel for the City of Englewood

Peter D. Nichols, #33167  
Geoffrey M. Williamson, #35891  
Patrick M. Haines, #38970  
Megan Christensen, #50344  
BERG HILL GREENLEAF RUSCITTI LLP



1712 Pearl Street  
Boulder, Colorado 80302  
Telephone: (303) 402-1600  
[pdn@bhgrlaw.com](mailto:pdn@bhgrlaw.com)  
[gmw@bhgrlaw.com](mailto:gmw@bhgrlaw.com)  
[pmh@bhgrlaw.com](mailto:pmh@bhgrlaw.com)  
[megan.christensen@bhgrlaw.com](mailto:megan.christensen@bhgrlaw.com)

Attorneys for the City of Lafayette  
David F. Bower, #39405  
JOHNSON & REPUCCI LLP  
850 W. South Boulder Rd, Suite 100  
Louisville, Colorado 80027  
Telephone: (303) 442-1900  
[dfbower@j-rlaw.com](mailto:dfbower@j-rlaw.com)

Attorneys for Opposer City of Longmont  
David S. Hayes, #28661  
Hayes Poznanovic Korver, LLC  
700 17th Street, Suite 1800  
Denver, CO 80202  
Phone: (303) 825-1980  
[dhayes@hpkwaterlaw.com](mailto:dhayes@hpkwaterlaw.com)

Attorneys for Opposer City of Westminster  
Lee H. Johnson, #18852  
Mason H. Brown, #44831  
Katrina B. Fiscella, #46343  
CARLSON, HAMMOND & PADDOCK, L.L.C.  
1900 Grant Street, Suite 1200  
Denver, Colorado 80203  
Telephone: (303) 861-9000  
[ljohnson@chp-law.com](mailto:ljohnson@chp-law.com)  
[mbrown@chp-law.com](mailto:mbrown@chp-law.com)  
[kfiscella@chp-law.com](mailto:kfiscella@chp-law.com)

Attorneys for Dream Weaver Holdings, LLC

Jennifer M. DiLalla, #40319

Moses, Wittemyer, Harrison and Woodruff, P.C.

2595 Canyon Boulevard, Suite 240

Boulder, Colorado 80302

Telephone: (303) 443-8782

[jdilalla@mwhw.com](mailto:jdilalla@mwhw.com)

Attorneys for Opposer Godding Ditch Company

Scott E. Holwick, #32009

Lyons Gaddis, P.C.

P.O. Box 978

Longmont, CO 80502-0978

Telephone: (303) 776-9900

[sholwick@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:sholwick@lyonsgaddis.com)

Attorneys for Opposer Last Chance Ditch Company

Scott E. Holwick, #32009

Casey J. Weaver, #56605

Lyons Gaddis, P.C.

P.O. Box 978

Longmont, CO 80502-0978

Telephone: (303) 776-9900

[sholwick@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:sholwick@lyonsgaddis.com)

[cweaver@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:cweaver@lyonsgaddis.com)

Attorney for L.G. Everist, Inc.

Matthew L. Merrill, Reg. No. 37918 MERRILL LAW LLC

1401 Delgany St. #404

Denver, CO 80202

Telephone: (303) 947-4453

[matthew@merrillwaterlaw.com](mailto:matthew@merrillwaterlaw.com)

Attorneys for Opposer the Little Thompson Water District

CARLSON, HAMMOND & PADDOCK, L.L.C.

Lee H. Johnson, # 18852

Katrina B. Fiscella, # 46343

Sara B. Wiedemann, #46383

1900 Grant Street, Suite 1200

Denver, Colorado 80203

Telephone: (303) 861-9000

[ljohnson@chp-law.com](mailto:ljohnson@chp-law.com)

[mbrown@chp-law.com](mailto:mbrown@chp-law.com)

[kfiscella@chp-law.com](mailto:kfiscella@chp-law.com)

Attorneys for The New Coal Ridge Ditch Company

Jeffrey J. Kahn, #6894

Casey J. Weaver, #56605

Lyons Gaddis, P.C.

P.O. Box 978

Longmont, CO 80502-0978

Telephone: (303) 776-9900

[jkahn@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:jkahn@lyonsgaddis.com)

[cweaver@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:cweaver@lyonsgaddis.com)

Attorneys for the New Consolidated Lower Boulder Reservoir and Ditch Company

Jeffrey J. Kahn, #6894

Casey J. Weaver, #56605

Lyons Gaddis, P.C.

P.O. Box 978

Longmont, CO 80502-0978

Telephone: (303) 776-9900

[jkahn@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:jkahn@lyonsgaddis.com)

[cweaver@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:cweaver@lyonsgaddis.com)

Attorneys for Public Service Company of Colorado, a Colorado Corporation

Carolyn F. Burr, #25978

James M. Noble, #36716

Jens Jensen, #47471

Kyle B. Howe, #58122

WELBORN SULLIVAN MECK & TOOLEY, P.C.

1401 Lawrence Street, Suite 1800

Denver, Colorado 80202

Telephone: (303) 830-2500

[cburr@wsmtlaw.com](mailto:cburr@wsmtlaw.com)

[jnoble@wsmtlaw.com](mailto:jnoble@wsmtlaw.com)

[jjensen@wsmtlaw.com](mailto:jjensen@wsmtlaw.com)

[khowe@wsmtlaw.com](mailto:khowe@wsmtlaw.com)

Attorneys for Opposer the Rural Ditch Company

Scott E. Holwick, #32009

Casey J. Weaver, #56605

Lyons Gaddis, PC

P.O. Box 978

Longmont, CO 80502-0978

Telephone: (303) 776-9900

[sholwick@lvonseaddis.com](mailto:sholwick@lvonseaddis.com)

[cweaver@lvonseaddis.com](mailto:cweaver@lvonseaddis.com)

Attorneys for Shores on Plum Creek Metropolitan District No. 1

Jennifer M. DiLalla, #40319

Moses, Wittemyer, Harrison and Woodruff, P.C.

2595 Canyon Boulevard, Suite 240

Boulder, Colorado 80302

Telephone: (303) 443-8782

[jdilalla@mwhw.com](mailto:jdilalla@mwhw.com)

Attorneys for St. Vrain & Left Hand Water Conservancy District

Scott E. Holwick, #32009

Lyons Gaddis, P.C.

P.O. Box 978

Longmont, CO 80502-0978

Telephone: (303) 776-9900

[sholwick@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:sholwick@lyonsgaddis.com)

Attorney for the State and Division Engineers for Water Division 1

PHILIP J. WEISER, Attorney General

EMILIE B. POLLEY, Assistant Attorney General, #51296

Water Resources Unit Natural Resources & Environment Section

Office of the Colorado Attorney General

1300 Broadway, 7th Floor

Denver, CO 80203

Telephone: (720) 508-6314

[emilie.polley@coag.gov](mailto:emilie.polley@coag.gov)

Attorneys for Town of Frederick

Jennifer M. DiLalla, #40319

Moses, Wittemyer, Harrison and Woodruff, P.C.

2595 Canyon Blvd., Suite 240

Boulder, CO 80302

Telephone: (303) 443-8782

[jdilalla@mwhw.com](mailto:jdilalla@mwhw.com)

Attorneys for Opposer Varra Companies, Inc. Matthew S. Poznanovic, #29990

Eric K. Trout, #48640

Hayes Poznanovic Korver LLC

700 17th Street, Suite 1800

Denver, CO 80202

Telephone: 303-825-1980

[matt@hpkwaterlaw.com](mailto:matt@hpkwaterlaw.com)

[eric@hpkwaterlaw.com](mailto:eric@hpkwaterlaw.com)

Attorneys for Opposer Water Users Association of District No. 6

Scott E. Holwick, #32009

Lyons Gaddis

P.O. Box 978

Longmont, CO 80502-0978

Telephone: (303) 776-9900

[sholwick@lyonsgaddis.com](mailto:sholwick@lyonsgaddis.com)

**VI. Appendices**

**Copies of the following orders are attached as Appendix A and B:**

A. Order Granting in Part, and Denying in Part, St. Vrain Sanitation District's Motion to Dismiss Pursuant to C.R.C.P. Rule 41(b)(1), entered on December 4, 2023.

B. Findings of Fact, Conclusion of Law, and Decree of the Water Court, entered on February 21, 2024.

DATED April 10, 2024.

LAWRENCE CUSTER GRASMICK JONES & DONOVAN, LLP



---

Bradley C. Grasmick, #35055

Wesley S. Knoll, #48747

Richard LiPuma #17892

Jacklyn P. Gunn, #59386

*Attorneys for Plaintiff-Appellant*

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that on April 10, 2024, a true and correct copy of the foregoing APPLICANT-APPELLANT TOWN OF FIRESTONE’S NOTICE OF APPEAL was served via Colorado Court E-Filing Service upon all parties of record in Case No. 19CW3236, District Court, Water Division 1.

Party Name	Party Type	Attorney Name
Bcl Colorado Lp	Opposer	MICHAEL STUART DAVIDSON (Johnson and Repucci LLP) STEPHEN C LARSON (Johnson and Repucci LLP)
City And County of Broomfield	Opposer	ANDREA LUISE BENSON (Alperstein Covell PC) CYNTHIA FRAZER COVELL (Alperstein Covell PC) GILBERT Y MARCHAND (Alperstein Covell PC)
City of Boulder	Opposer	JESSICA LYNN PAULT-ATIASE (Boulder City Attorneys Office) LISA M THOMPSON (Trout Raley) MICHAEL A KOPP (Trout Raley)
City of Englewood	Opposer	GEOFFREY M WILLIAMSON (Berg Hill Greenleaf and Ruscitti LLP) MEGAN CHRISTENSEN (Berg Hill Greenleaf and Ruscitti LLP) PATRICK MICHAEL HAINES (Berg Hill Greenleaf and Ruscitti LLP) PETER D NICHOLS (Berg Hill Greenleaf and Ruscitti LLP)
City of Lafayette	Opposer	DAVID FRANCIS BOWER (Johnson and Repucci LLP)
City of Longmont	Opposer	DAVID S HAYES (Hayes Poznanovic Korver LLC)
City of Westminster	Opposer	KATRINA FISCELLA (Carlson, Hammond & Paddock, L.L.C.) LEE H JOHNSON (Carlson, Hammond & Paddock, L.L.C.) MASON HAMILL BROWN (Carlson, Hammond & Paddock, L.L.C.) SARAH BARZ WIEDEMANN (Carlson, Hammond & Paddock, L.L.C.)
Division 1 Engineer	Division Engineer	DIVISION 1 WATER ENGINEER (State of Colorado DWR Division 1)
Dream Weaver Holdings Llc	Opposer	JENNIFER M DILALLA (Moses, Wittemyer, Harrison and Woodruff, P.C.)
Godding Ditch Company	Opposer	SCOTT E HOLWICK (Lyons Gaddis PC)

<b>Party Name</b>	<b>Party Type</b>	<b>Attorney Name</b>
Last Chance Ditch Company	Opposer	SCOTT E HOLWICK (Lyons Gaddis PC)
Lg Everist Inc	Opposer	MATTHEW LAKE MERRILL (MERRILL LAW LLC)
Little Thompson Water District	Opposer	KATRINA FISCELLA (Carlson, Hammond & Paddock, L.L.C.) LEE H JOHNSON (Carlson, Hammond & Paddock, L.L.C.) SARAH BARZ WIEDEMANN (Carlson, Hammond & Paddock, L.L.C.)
New Coal Ridge Ditch Company	Opposer	CASEY JOSEPH WEAVER (Lyons Gaddis PC) JEFFREY J KAHN (Lyons Gaddis PC)
New Cons Lower Boulder Res And Ditch Co	Opposer	CASEY JOSEPH WEAVER (Lyons Gaddis PC) JEFFREY J KAHN (Lyons Gaddis PC)
Public Service Company of Colorado	Opposer	CAROLYN F BURR (Welborn Sullivan Meck & Tooley, P.C.) JAMES MERLE NOBLE (Welborn Sullivan Meck & Tooley, P.C.) JENS JENSEN KYLE BARAK HOWE (Welborn Sullivan Meck & Tooley, P.C.)
Rural Ditch Company	Opposer	SCOTT E HOLWICK (Lyons Gaddis PC)
Shores On Plum Creek Met Dist No 1	Opposer	JENNIFER M DILALLA (Moses, Wittemyer, Harrison and Woodruff, P.C.)
St Vrain Left Hand Water Cons Dist	Opposer	SCOTT E HOLWICK (Lyons Gaddis PC)
St Vrain Sanitation District	Opposer	CASEY JOSEPH WEAVER (Lyons Gaddis PC) MATTHEW MACHADO (Lyons Gaddis PC)
State Engineer	State Engineer	COLORADO DIVISION OF WATER RESOURCES (State of Colorado - Division of Water Resources)
State Engineer And Water Div 1 Engineer	Opposer	EMILIE BLAKE POLLEY (CO Attorney General)
Town of Firestone	Applicant	BRADLEY CHARLES GRASMICK (Lawrence Custer Grasmick Jones and Donovan LLP) JACKLYN PATRICIA GUNN (Lawrence Custer Grasmick Jones and Donovan LLP) RICHARD T LI PUMA (Lawrence Custer Grasmick Jones and Donovan LLP) WESLEY SAGE KNOLL (Lawrence Custer Grasmick Jones and Donovan LLP)
Town of Frederick	Opposer	JENNIFER M DILALLA (Moses, Wittemyer, Harrison and Woodruff, P.C.) JOSH BLAKE BOISSEVAIN (Colorado Water Trust)



Party Name	Party Type	Attorney Name
Varra Companies Inc	Opposer	ERIC KRISBERG TROUT (McGeady Becher PC) MATTHEW STEVEN POZNANOVIC (Hayes Poznanovic Korver LLC)
Water Users Association of District No 6	Opposer	CASEY JOSEPH WEAVER (Lyons Gaddis PC) SCOTT E HOLWICK (Lyons Gaddis PC)

---

Moana M. Thaden, Legal Assistant

*Pursuant to Rule 121, a printed or printable copy of the document bearing the original, electronic, or scanned signature is on file at the law offices of Lawrence Custer Grasmick Jones & Donovan, LLP*