ANNOUNCEMENTS COLORADO COURT OF APPEALS October 27, 2022

"Slip opinions" are the opinions as filed by the judges with the clerk. Slip opinions are subject to modification, rehearing, withdrawal, or clerical corrections. A link to any modifications to previously posted opinions will appear in the Petition for Rehearing section of the announcement document the day the changes are announced.

PUBLISHED OPINIONS

2022COA127

Court of Appeals No. <u>19CA0395</u> Arapahoe County District Court No. 17CR2206 Honorable Ryan J. Stuart, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Terance Jamal Black,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division III Opinion by JUDGE YUN Fox and Tow, JJ., concur

-2-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

2022COA128 Court of Appeals No. 21CA0708 El Paso County District Court No. 20CV31562 Honorable Laura N. Findorff, Judge

Education ReEnvisioned BOCES,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Colorado Literacy and Learning Center,

Third-Party Defendant-Appellee,

and

Colorado Springs School District 11,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT REVERSED AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division VII Opinion by JUDGE PAWAR Harris and Gomez, JJ., concur 2022COA130 Court of Appeals No. 21CA1241 Adams County District Court No. 19CV31524 Honorable Kyle Seedorf, Judge

Home Improvement, Inc. and Pauline W. O'Neil Intervivos Trust, dated 5-24-1967 and amended 7-3-2002, a Colorado trust, owner,

Plaintiffs-Appellees,

v.

Jose Villar,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDERS REVERSED AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division III Opinion by JUDGE TOW Fox and Yun, JJ., concur

-4-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

2022COA131 Court of Appeals No. 21CA2032 City and County of Denver District Court No. 20CV32320 Honorable Christopher J. Baumann, Judge

Environmental Defense Fund and WildEarth Guardians,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

Colorado Department of Public Health and Environment, Colorado Air Quality Control Commission, and Colorado Air Pollution Control Division,

Defendants-Appellees,

and

Public Service Company of Colorado,

Intervenor-Defendant and Appellee.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division III Opinion by JUDGE FOX Tow and Yun, JJ., concur

-5-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

UNPUBLISHED OPINIONS

Court of Appeals No. 18CA1311 Arapahoe County District Court Nos. 16CR2067 & 16CR2415 Honorable Kurt A. Horton, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Daryon Jovan Palmer,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division IV Opinion by JUDGE GRAHAM* Grove and Schutz, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 19CA0322 Weld County District Court No. 16CR1610 Honorable Shannon D. Lyons, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Marcello Jose Rodriquez, Jr.,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division IV Opinion by JUDGE GROVE Schutz and Graham*, JJ., concur

-6-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 19CA0480 Mesa County District Court No. 16CR5967 Honorable Brian J. Flynn, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Nathaniel Gage Pierson,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division VII Opinion by JUDGE GOMEZ Harris and Pawar, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 19CA1247 Arapahoe County District Court No. 17CR998 Honorable Darren L. Vahle, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

James Edwin Hoganson,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AND SENTENCES AFFIRMED, ORDER VACATED, AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division V Opinion by JUDGE NAVARRO Welling and Johnson, JJ., concur

-7-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 19CA1251 Jefferson County District Court No. 18CR1372 Honorable Randall C. Arp, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Devon Drizzt Howard,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division III Opinion by JUDGE FOX Tow and Yun, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 19CA1483 Baca County District Court No. 16CR29 Honorable Stanley A. Brinkley, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Eddie Dale Hoover,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AND SENTENCE AFFIRMED

Division V Opinion by JUDGE WELLING Navarro and Johnson, JJ., concur

-8-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 19CA1520 Larimer County District Court No. 17CR1011 Honorable Thomas R. French, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Scot Lee Stockwell,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division A Opinion by CHIEF JUDGE ROMÁN Martinez* and Casebolt*, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 20CA0319 Jefferson County District Court No. 19CR9 Honorable Randall C. Arp, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Ruben Alexander Hernandez,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division VI Opinion by JUDGE LIPINSKY Freyre and Taubman*, JJ., concur

-9-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 20CA0706 El Paso County District Court No. 19CR3352 Honorable Robin Chittum, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

William Franklin Swatsenbarg,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division I Opinion by JUDGE VOGT* Dailey and Furman, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 20CA0958 Jefferson County District Court No. 06CR1642 Honorable Jeffrey R. Pilkington, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Marshall Adam Walker,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division IV Opinion by JUDGE GROVE Dunn and Schutz, JJ., concur

-10-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 20CA0974 El Paso County District Court No. 19CR404 Honorable Robert L. Lowrey, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Emilio Esteban Espinoza,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division IV Opinion by JUDGE GRAHAM* Grove and Schutz, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 20CA1114 City and County of Denver District Court No. 16CR392 Honorable Karen L. Brody, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Rickford Reginald Foo,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division III Opinion by JUDGE FOX Tow and Yun, JJ., concur

-11-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 20CA1533 Weld County District Court No. 19CR142 Honorable Marcelo A. Kopcow, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Charles Young-Hicks,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division V Opinion by JUDGE WELLING Navarro and Johnson, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 20CA1827 Jefferson County District Court No. 20CR81 Honorable Robert Lochary, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Joseph Raymond Saiz,

Defendant-Appellant.

SENTENCE REVERSED AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division VI Opinion by JUDGE TAUBMAN* Freyre and Lipinsky, JJ., concur

-12-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0253 City and County of Denver District Court No. 06CR6258 Honorable David H. Goldberg, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Terry Eugene Owen,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division A Opinion by JUSTICE MARTINEZ* Román, C.J., and Casebolt*, J., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0394 Garfield County District Court No. 16CR281 Honorable John F. Neiley, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Nathaniel Raymond Trujillo,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division III Opinion by JUDGE TOW Fox and Yun, JJ., concur

-13-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0808 Eagle County District Court No. 18DR30009 Honorable Reed W. Owens, Judge

In re the Parental Responsibilities Concerning F.G.B. and W.M.B., Children,

and Concerning Georgina Baker,

Appellant,

and

Bradley Ryan,

Appellee.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division V Opinion by JUDGE NAVARRO Welling and Johnson, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0823 Adams County District Court No. 19CV31676 Honorable Teri L. Vasquez, Judge

Heritage Todd Creek Master Association, Inc., a Colorado non-profit corporation,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Michael L. Naeger,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division I Opinion by JUDGE DAILEY Furman and Richman, JJ., concur

-14-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0833 Larimer County District Court No. 20CV30580 Honorable Daniel M. McDonald, Judge

City of Fort Collins, Colorado, a municipal corporation,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

v.

Board of County Commissioners of Larimer County, Colorado, and StreetMediaGroup, LLC,

Defendants-Appellees.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division III Opinion by JUDGE J. JONES Welling and Schutz, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0843 Jackson County District Court No. 20CV30001 Honorable Stephen J. Jouard, Judge

Rex A. Shaw and Mary K. Shaw,

Plaintiffs-Appellees and Cross-Appellants,

v.

Colorado Department of Local Affairs, Division of Housing,

Defendant-Appellant and Cross-Appellee.

JUDGMENT REVERSED IN PART AND VACATED IN PART

Division I Opinion by JUDGE VOGT* Dailey and Furman, JJ., concur

-15-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0990 City and County of Denver District Court No. 19DR30926 Honorable Karen L. Brody, Judge

In re the Parental Responsibilities Concerning A.R.M-R, and T.A.M., Children,

and Concerning Jacob A. Ringstad,

Appellee,

and

Noah Linge,

Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED IN PART, REVERSED IN PART, AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division I Opinion by JUDGE DAILEY Furman and Vogt*, JJ., concur

-16-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1048 Arapahoe County District Court No. 21PR30192 Honorable Michelle A. Amico, Judge

In re the Estate of Robert Dwayne Trujillo, deceased.

Claudia Rea Knox

Petitioner-Appellant,

and

Kenneth Lee Trujillo,

Appellant,

v.

Christina Main,

Appellee.

ORDER REVERSED AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division VII Opinion by JUDGE GOMEZ Harris and Pawar, JJ., concur

-17-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1067 Boulder County District Court No. 20CV30801 Honorable Bruce Langer, Judge

Niall O'Toole; Mary Anne Carroll; Renala Condominium Association, Inc.; Thomas J. McWilliams; and M3 Investments, LLC,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

City of Boulder, a home rule municipality of the state of Colorado; Aaron Brockett, in his official capacity as Mayor of the city of Boulder; Rachel Friend, in her official capacity as Mayor Pro Tem of the city of Boulder; Matt Benjamin, in his official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Lauren Folkerts, in her official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Junie Joseph, in her official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Nicole Speer, in her official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Mark Wallach, in his official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Tara Winer, in her official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Bob Yates, in his official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Bob Yates, in his official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Bob Yates, in his official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Bob Yates, in his official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Bob Yates, in his official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Bob Yates, in his official capacity as councilperson for the city of Boulder; Bob Yates, in his

Defendants-Appellees.

JUDGMENT REVERSED AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division III Opinion by JUDGE FOX Tow and Yun, JJ., concur

-18-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1171 City and County of Denver District Court No. 92CR1583 Honorable Martin F. Egelhoff, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

John Patrick Fletcher,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division A Opinion by JUDGE CASEBOLT* Román, C.J., and Martinez*, J., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1183 Jefferson County District Court No. 18PR30992 Honorable Todd L. Vriesman, Judge

In re the Estate of Jason Christopher Yardley, deceased.

Julia Hulse,

Appellant,

v.

Jason Yardley,

Appellee.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division III Opinion by JUDGE YUN Fox and Tow, JJ., concur

-19-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1246 City and County of Denver District Court No. 09CR938 Honorable Kenneth M. Laff, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Ralph H. Jackson,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division VI Opinion by JUDGE VOGT* Freyre and Lipinsky, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1280 Adams County District Court No. 20CV30730 Honorable Jeffrey Smith, Judge

Fortress Property Group, LLC, a Colorado limited liability company,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Bank of New York Mellon, f/k/a Bank of New York, as Successor Trustee to JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A. as Trustee First Franklin Mortgage Loan Trust2005-FF1-Mortgage-Backed Pass-ThroughCertificates, Series 2005-FF1

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division IV Opinion by JUDGE SCHUTZ Grove and Graham*, JJ., concur

-20-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1447 Jefferson County District Court No. 19CR3871 Honorable Jeffrey R. Pilkington, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Zain Alexander Stokley,

Defendant-Appellant.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division III Opinion by JUDGE YUN Fox and Tow, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1461 City and County of Denver District Court No. 20CV30043 Honorable Michael J. Vallejos, Judge

Karen L. Chapman,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

v.

Richard Ferretti,

Defendant-Appellee.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED IN PART, REVERSED IN PART, AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division C Opinion by JUDGE RICHMAN Dunn and Kuhn, JJ., concur

-21-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1528 City and County of Denver District Court No. 18CV32511 Honorable J. Eric Elliff, Judge

Robert Vigil and Jamie Vigil,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

Virginia Williams,

Defendant-Appellee.

JUDGMENT REVERSED AND CASE REMANDED WITH DIRECTIONS

Division B Opinion by JUDGE TOW Grove and Schutz, JJ., concur

-22-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1640 City and County of Denver District Court No. 19CV32644 Honorable Christopher J. Bauman, Judge

Phill Foster and Company,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

and

James Stern,

Attorney-Appellant,

v.

Robin Mann,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

and

Sharon	Ρ.	Salazar,
011001011		

Appellee.

ORDER VACATED

Division I Opinion by JUDGE FURMAN Dailey and Vogt*, JJ., concur

-23-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1655 El Paso County District Court No. 20JV927 Honorable Jessica L. Curtis, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Appellee,

In the Interest of J.D., N.D., and A.D., Children,

and Concerning C.D.,

Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division VI Opinion by JUDGE FREYRE Lipinsky and Taubman*, JJ., concur

-24-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA1831 Jefferson County District Court No. 10PR611 Honorable Meegan A. Miloud, Magistrate

In the Matter of Jennifer Verzuh, protected person,

and

Peter Moyson,

Appellant,

v.

Colorado Fund for People with Disabilities, Inc.,

Appellee.

APPEAL DISMISSED IN PART AND ORDER VACATED

Division B Opinion by JUDGE GROVE Tow and Schutz, JJ., concur

-25-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 22CA0002 Industrial Claim Appeals Office of the State of Colorado WC No. 4-979-139

Malon Dean Tygrett,

Petitioner,

v.

Industrial Claim Appeals Office of the State of Colorado, Denver Water, Travelers Indemity Company, and Hugh Macaulay, M.D.,

Respondents.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division IV Opinion by JUDGE SCHUTZ Grove and Graham*, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 22CA0063 Arapahoe County District Court No. 21CV101 Honorable Frederick T. Martinez, Judge

Renters Warehouse,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Rodney DeWalt,

Defendant-Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division C Opinion by JUDGE KUHN Dunn and Casebolt*, JJ., concur

-26-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 22CA0277 Arapahoe County District Court No. 17CV227 Honorable John E. Scipione, Judge

Michael Gibson,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

v.

John Callahan, Christie Clare, Michelle Clare, and Stephen Dawson,

Defendants-Appellees.

ORDER AFFIRMED

Division B Opinion by JUDGE SCHUTZ Tow and Grove, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 22CA0290 Larimer County District Court No. 21JV70 Honorable Joseph D. Findley, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Appellee,

In the Interest of S.T. and L.T., Children,

and Concerning R.V.,

Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division A Opinion by JUDGE CASEBOLT* Román, C.J., and Taubman*, J., concur

-27-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 22CA0323 City and County of Denver Juvenile Court No. 20JV799 Honorable D. Brett Woods, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Appellee,

In the Interest of E.D.S-P. a Child,

and Concerning D.M.S.,

Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division II Opinion by JUDGE BROWN J. Jones and Kuhn, JJ., concur

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Court of Appeals No. 22CA0404 City and County of Denver Juvenile Court No. 20JV23 Honorable Laurie A. Clark, Judge

The People of the State of Colorado,

Appellee,

In the Interest of R.J.G. a Child,

and Concerning A.G.G., Jr.,

Appellant.

JUDGMENT AFFIRMED

Division A Opinion by JUDGE TAUBMAN* Román, C.J., and Casebolt*, J., concur

-28-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

PETITIONS FOR REHEARING

Court of Appeals No. 18CA2436

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Tiffany Ann Miller,

Defendant-Appellant.

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Petition for Rehearing <u>DENIED</u>

Court of Appeals No. 19CA2189

The People of the State of Colorado,

Plaintiff-Appellee,

v.

Constance M. Volz,

Defendant-Appellant.

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Petition for Rehearing <u>DENIED</u>

-29-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0343

James Woo,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

v.

Jose Angel Baez, Michelle Medina, and Richard Bednarski,

Defendants-Appellees.

Petition for Rehearing <u>DENIED</u>

Court of Appeals No. 21CA0553

Franklin E. Walter,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

v.

Centura Health Corporation, a Colorado non-profit corporation,

Defendant-Appellee.

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Petition for Rehearing <u>DENIED</u>

-30-ANNOUNCEMENTS Colorado Court of Appeals November 3, 2022

Court of Appeals Nos. 21CA1410 & 21CA1417

In re the Marriage of

Christopher Hodyl,

Appellee,

and

Martine Bernard,

Appellant.

NOT PUBLISHED PURSUANT TO C.A.R. 35(e)

Petition for Rehearing <u>DENIED</u>

*Sitting by assignment of the Chief Justice under provisions of Colo. Const. art. VI, § 5(3), and § 24-51-1105, C.R.S. 2022.